

Guilt and Punishment in “Law and Literature”

International Studies in Law and Literature

Editor-in-Chief

María José Falcón y Tella (*Complutense University of Madrid, Spain*)

Editorial Board

James Boyd White (*University of Michigan, USA*)

Richard H. Weisberg (*Carnegie Mellon University, Cardozo Law School,
Yeshiva University, USA*)

François Ost (*Saint-Louis University, Brussels, Belgium*)

Carla Faralli (*University of Bologna, Italy*)

M. Paola Mittica (*Urbino University, Italy*)

Jeanne Gaakeer (*Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*)

Alfredo Montoya Melgar† (*Complutense University of Madrid, Spain*)

Luis Martí Mingarro (*University of Salamanca, Spain*)

Martín Laclau (*University of El Salvador, Buenos Aires, Argentina*)

Marco Wan (*Law School, University of Hong Kong, China*)

Shaun McVeigh (*Institute of International Law and Humanities,
University of Melbourne, Victoria, Australia*)

Marett Leiboff (*University of Wollongong Law School, Australia*)

Frode Helmich Pedersen (*University of Bergen, Norway*)

Helena Whalen-Bridge (*National University of Singapore Law School,
Singapore*)

VOLUME 6

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/isll*

Guilt and Punishment in “Law and Literature”

Cervantes, Dostoyevsky, and Kafka

By

María José Falcón y Tella

Translated by

Pablo Falcón Dieguez



BRILL | NIJHOFF

Originally published by Marcial Pons Ediciones Jurídicas y Sociales in 2026 under the title *Culpa y castigo en "Derecho y Literatura"*. Cervantes, Dostoievski y Kafka.

ISSN 2773-191X

ISBN 978-90-04-76599-3

ISBN 978-90-04-76600-6 (PDF)

DOI <https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004766006>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2026938292

© 2026 the author(s), published by Koninklijke Brill BV, Plantijnstraat 2, 2321 JC Leiden, The Netherlands.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Text and datamining for commercial purposes requires the publisher's permission.

Brill Nijhoff and Koninklijke Brill BV are part of De Gruyter Brill.
www.degruyterbrill.com

Questions about General Product Safety Regulation: productsafety@degruyterbrill.com

To my family



The first punishment of the guilty is that his conscience judges him
and never absolves him.

Juvenal

• • •

It is ugly to be worthy of punishment, but inglorious to punish.

Michel Foucault

• •
•

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Guilt	3
1	Psychological Perspective	3
1.1	Criminality as Deviant Behavior	4
1.2	Punishment as the Intentional Infliction of Suffering	6
1.3	Guilt as a Manifestation of Depression: Antipsychiatry	9
1.4	Emotions and Psychological Mechanisms Driving Punishment	9
1.4.1	Psychological Ambivalence regarding the Punishment of Others: The Contributions of Norbert Elias and Petrus Cornelis Spierenburg	9
1.4.2	Émile Durkheim and Adam Smith: Resentment	12
1.4.3	Friedrich Wilhelm Nietzsche, George Herbert Mead, and Sigmund Freud: The Role of Psychoanalysis	16
1.5	The Influence of Punitive Rituals as Architects and Manipulators of Emotions	18
1.6	The Experiment Conducted by Stanley Milgram	19
2	Legal Perspective	21
2.1	Penalties	21
2.1.1	Free Will	21
2.1.2	Guilt as a Moral Appraisal	21
2.1.3	Imputability and Ethical Accountability	23
2.2	Deterrents	23
2.2.1	Determinism	23
2.2.2	Dangerousness as a Probabilistic Evaluation	28
2.2.3	Social Responsibility or Necessity	28
3	Religious Perspective	28
3.1	The Offender as a Malefactor Requiring Rehabilitation	28
3.2	The Christian Faith: Balancing Retribution and Forgiveness – The Doctrines of the Bible	29
3.2.1	The Old Testament	30
3.2.2	The New Testament	30

3	Punishment	33
1	Punishment: Balancing Retribution and Prevention through Penalties and Deterrents	33
1.1	The Basis and Rationale of Punishment	33
1.2	The Purpose of Punishment	34
1.3	Theoretical Frameworks Advocating Punishment	35
1.3.1	The Absolutist Theories	35
1.3.2	The Relativistic Theories	35
1.3.3	The Eclectic, Mixed, or Union Theories	36
1.4	Dispute among Philosophical Schools	37
1.5	Concept of the State	37
1.6	Dimension of Existence	37
1.6.1	Divergences from the Ideal	37
1.6.2	Critique	38
2	Advancing a More Compassionate Criminal Law: The Privatization of Criminal Law	39
2.1	Historical Context	40
2.2	Comparative Law	41
2.3	Restorative Justice and Probation in Criminal Law	42
2.4	Ameliorating Damage: Toward a Reconciliatory Framework	42
2.5	What if We Eliminated Punishment?	44
2.6	Managing Conflict as an Inescapable Reality	45
2.7	Resocializing Society to Mitigate Injustice Rather than Resocializing the Individual	46
2.8	The Refinement of Criminal Law	47
2.9	Addressing a Multifaceted Interdisciplinary Issue	47
4	Guilt and Punishment in Some of the Greatest Works of World Literature of All Time	48
1	<i>The Oresteia</i> by Aeschylus	48
2	<i>Antigone</i> by Sophocles	50
3	<i>Electra</i> by Euripides	51
4	The Judgment of Solomon in <i>the Bible</i>	52
5	<i>Doctor Faustus</i> by Christopher Marlowe	52
6	William Shakespeare	53
6.1	<i>The Merchant of Venice</i>	53
6.2	<i>Hamlet</i>	54
7	<i>Faust</i> by Johann Wolfgang Von Goethe	55
8	<i>Michael Kohlhaas</i> by Heinrich Von Kleist	56

9	<i>The Count of Monte Cristo</i> by Alexandre Dumas	56
10	<i>Wuthering Heights</i> by Emily Brontë	57
11	<i>Billy Budd, Sailor</i> by Herman Melville	58
12	<i>The Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde</i> by Robert Louis Stevenson	60
13	<i>1984</i> by George Orwell	62
14	<i>The Firm</i> by John Grisham	63
5	Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra	64
1	Significant Aspects of His Life ¹	64
2	Cervantes and the Law	70
3	Analyzed Work: <i>Don Quixote</i>	71
3.1	General Considerations	71
3.2	Aggravating and Mitigating Factors in the Narrative	82
3.3	Distinct Offenses Referenced in the Novel	82
3.4	<i>Don Quixote's</i> Perspective on Criminals	84
3.5	The Episode of the Galley Slaves	87
6	Fyodor Mikhailovich Dostoyevsky	91
1	Significant Aspects of His Life ¹	91
2	Analyzed Works	95
2.1	<i>Crime and Punishment</i>	95
2.2	<i>The Brothers Karamazov</i>	102
7	Franz Kafka	108
1	Significant Aspects of His Life	108
2	Kafka and the Law	112
3	Analyzed Work	114
3.1	General Considerations	114
3.2	<i>The Trial</i>	115
3.2.1	An Incomplete Novel and an Open Work	115
3.2.2	Interpretations of the Work	116
3.2.3	Legal Aspects of the Work	120
3.2.4	Existence of Suffering, Displeasure, Pain, or Evil	126
3.2.5	Existence of a Previous Legal Offense	130
3.2.6	Punishment Must Be Inflicted upon the Author of the Offense: Punishment of the Innocent as a Form of Victimization	133
3.2.7	Punishment Must Be Intentionally Inflicted (in Contrast to Repentance) by Human Beings	

	(in Contrast to Divine Punishment) Who Are Distinct from the Offender (in Contrast to Self-Punishment) and by the Institutionalized Authority to Punish (in Contrast to Private Vengeance)	136
3.2.8	Desert as an All-Encompassing Concept of Merit – Positive – and Its Negative Version – Demerit – as a Justification for Punishment: Can We Speak of Punishment as Reward?	141
3.2.9	Bureaucracy	146

Bibliography	149
---------------------	-----

Index	203
--------------	-----